

Marc Aurel Stein
Illustrated Rājatarāṅgiṇī
Together with
Eugen Hultzsch's Critical Notes and Stein's Maps

Studia Indologica Universitatis Halensis

Band 6

Herausgegeben von

Walter Slaje, Martin-Luther-Universität Halle-Wittenberg

unter Mitwirkung von

Katrin Einicke und Andreas Pohlus

Marc Aurel Stein

Illustrated Rājatarāṅgiṅī

**Together with Eugen Hultzsch's Critical Notes
and Stein's Maps**

Edited by Luther Obrock
in Collaboration with Katrin Einicke

Luther Obrock is a doctoral candidate at the University of California, Berkeley. His research focuses on Sanskrit in Kashmir during the Sultanate and Mughal Periods.

Katrin Einicke holds a doctorate in Indology. She is a research associate at the Institute for Indology of the University of Halle.

Gedruckt mit Mitteln des Indologischen Seminars der Martin-Luther-Universität
Halle-Wittenberg

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in
der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische
Daten sind im Internet über <http://dnb.d-nb.de> abrufbar.

LXXVIII

© Universitätsverlag Halle-Wittenberg, Halle an der Saale 2013

Printed in Germany. Alle Rechte, auch die des Nachdrucks von Auszügen, der photomechanischen
Wiedergabe und der Übersetzung, vorbehalten.

Umschlaggestaltung: Horst Stöllger – pixicato GmbH, Hannover
Satz und Layout: Claudius Naumann

ISBN 978-3-86977-077-2

In memoriam

Sir Marc Aurel Stein
(26. 11. 1862–26. 10. 1943)

on his
150th birthday

Contents

Foreword	9
MARC AUREL STEIN: <i>Illustrated Rājataranḡiṇī</i>	15
Prolegomena	17
Appendix I	23
Appendix II	35
Figures 1–47 illustrating Stein’s edition of the <i>Rājataranḡiṇī</i>	63
Figures 48–82 illustrating Stein’s “Memoirs”.	113
Literature and Indices	151
Untraced Photograph	153
Literature Cited	154
Place Names Included by Stein Without Specified Photographs.	156
Index of Figures and Citations in Stein’s <i>Rājataranḡiṇī</i>	157
Index of Proper Names in Stein’s <i>Illustrated Rājataranḡiṇī</i>	166
Index of Verses and Pages of the <i>Rājataranḡiṇī</i> with additional notes and illustrations in Stein’s <i>Illustrated Rājataranḡiṇī</i>	172
EUGEN HULTZSCH: Articles	177
Notes on Seventh Taranga. <i>Indian Antiquary</i> XL (1911): 97–102	179
Notes on Eighth Taranga. <i>Indian Antiquary</i> XLII (1913): 301–306	187
Kritische Bemerkungen. <i>ZDMG</i> 69 (1915): 129–167, 271–282	195
MARC AUREL STEIN: Maps	
Ancient Kaśmīr	
Ancient Śrīnagar	

Foreword

The desire here expressed for providing by graphic reproduction an important aid for the student of the Chronicle has been a special inducement to me for undertaking this re-issue of my work. The illustrations of ancient sites, ruined structures, etc., which figure in Kalhaṇa's narrative, have with a few exceptions been reproduced from photographs I was able to take myself on a tour from October–November 1940. Apart from the pleasure it afforded me of revisiting familiar scenes in surroundings and climatic conditions exceptionally favoured by nature, it offered the welcome opportunity of testing the accuracy of impressions and surveys dating back in many places to close on half a century. (The Bodleian Libraries, The University of Oxford, MS. Stein 391 p. 83, Appendix II *ad* I., p. xviii)

Marc Aurel Stein had long wanted to update and republish his edition of the poet Kalhaṇa's twelfth Sanskrit masterpiece, the *Rājatarāṅgiṇī*, a poem based on the lives of the kings of Kashmir. The edition and translation of the *Rājatarāṅgiṇī* was his first major contribution to Sanskrit studies¹ and its subject matter continued to fascinate Stein through his long and storied career. Indeed, Stein always maintained a special affinity for the land of Kashmir; a camp in the high alpine pasture of Mohand Marg became his home when he returned from one Central Asian expedition or when planning the next and his enduring engagement with the geography, literature, languages, and history of the Valley continued long after the publication of his edition and translation of the *Rājatarāṅgiṇī*. He followed the scholarship on Kashmir by scholars in India and Europe while continuing to conduct his own archaeological and geographical explorations within the Valley and its surroundings. After a result of half a century of further research and reflection, Stein finally undertook to republish an updated *Rājatarāṅgiṇī*.

The idea of reissuing the *Rājatarāṅgiṇī* with a corrected text and further notes dates to at least the 1920s, but Stein only completed the actual writing and photography in the early 1940s. In letters and notes, he made it clear that this updated version would be “illustrated” – furnished with photographs of the sites and locales which play such an important role in Kalhaṇa's poem. The existence of this so-called *Illustrated Rājatarāṅgiṇī* had been known secondarily through letters and references, yet after his death in 1943, the actual form which Stein's *Illustrated Rājatarāṅgiṇī* was to

¹ Stein's edition of the Sanskrit text appeared in 1892 followed by the two volume annotated translation in 1900.

take remained a mysteryⁱⁱ since even the existence of the manuscript of the *Illustrated Rājatarāṅgiṇī* was uncertain.

In the spring of 2011, I was able to spend a few days looking through the Stein archives kept in the Western Manuscripts Collection of Bodleian Library at the University of Oxford and found to my excitement that the written portion of the *Illustrated Rājatarāṅgiṇī* was available in a final, or very nearly final form. The manuscripts for this work were found among scattered notes documenting his engagement through the late 1930s and early 1940s with Sanskrit scholars, historians, and translators. These texts showed the ways in which his thinking had changed and become clarified, yet the written texts formed only a part of the overall project. These manuscripts pointed toward the second goal of Stein's planned volumes – to visually document the localities mentioned in Kalhaṇa's text. For Stein, the visual was of paramount importance to understand the *Rājatarāṅgiṇī*. He quotes Helmuth von Moltke to the effect that the landscape provides the only tangible remaining portion of an event. As an explorer and surveyor as well as a philologist, Stein's attentive eye shows in his attempt to locate the past in the visible, to see the landscape and its artifacts as the material portion of Kalhaṇa's poem. Stein's undertaking to capture these images is well documented. The Bodleian preserves notes showing the careful planning that Stein had made for what would be his final tour of the geographical and archaeological sites of Kashmir. In a list dated the fifth of September, 1940, he laid out the route and timetable of this last journey. The fruits of this expedition are the photographs here reproduced, deserving of further attention for both their illustration of the localities in the *Rājatarāṅgiṇī* and for their presentation of Kashmir in the early 1940s. Especially interesting are the many people, unnamed, often obscure, who appear in the photographs.

The collection of texts and photographs here presented are the culmination of Stein's labors between 1940 and 1943. The texts given here, with "Revised for press" written in his hand above, include a new introduction, which Stein calls the Prolegomena, two Appendices, and an incomplete handwritten list of photographs to be included as illustrations. These manuscripts provided a viable start to realizing, albeit belatedly, Stein's intention of producing the *Illustrated Rājatarāṅgiṇī*. From the photograph list, I was able to locate the majority of the listed photographs in either the Bodleian Library in Oxford or in the Hungarian Academy of Sciences in Budapest. The collection of these materials seems sufficiently complete to merit a publication for those interested in the Sanskrit text of the *Rājatarāṅgiṇī*, the history and geography of Kashmir, or photography and representation in 20th century South Asia.

ii The website "HLF-KBC Sir Aurel Stein's Kashmir Heritage Legacy" published by the Kashmir Bhanwan Center, Luton, UK, provides a brief overview of the history of this "unfinished task." See <http://www.siraurelstein.org.uk/illustrated1.html>.

The Prolegomena published here shows that the pictures and notes prepared for the *Illustrated Rājatarāṅgiṇī* were intended to supplement a reprint of the three original volumes of his edition and translation. In his introduction, Stein describes how he imagines the *Illustrated Rājatarāṅgiṇī* to look and how he sees it complementing his earlier work. The Appendices each show the result of much further thought on the *Rājatarāṅgiṇī* and each often provide corrections or improvements for the text and translation as well as updated notes for Stein's original publication. The shorter Appendix I is largely concerned with the Sanskrit text of the *Rājatarāṅgiṇī*. In it, Stein compares his 1892 text with the editions of Pandit Durgaprasāda and the philological work of Eugene (anglicized; German: Eugen) Hultzsch. Hultzsch's conjectures and emendations, largely based on manuscript M of the *Rājatarāṅgiṇī*,ⁱⁱⁱ provide Stein with valuable improvements to his own Sanskrit edition. Accordingly, he has also updated his translation of the text in light of these new readings. Appendix II adds further historical, archaeological, and topographical notes and discussions. Stein had followed the scholarship on ancient Kashmir with interest, and Appendix II attempts to bring his translation and notes in conversation with later works, especially *Ancient Monuments of Kashmir* by RAM CHANDRA KAK (1933).

While it seems likely that Stein imagined the new Prolegomena inserted at the beginning of an updated first volume of his translation of the *Rājatarāṅgiṇī* and the two new Appendices at the end of second volume (perhaps with the photographs distributed in their respective volumes),^{iv} it seemed advantageous to print these newly found materials together in one volume that can be consulted in concert with the prior three volumes of Stein's *Rājatarāṅgiṇī*. The three new texts and the photographs form the core of this volume.

The Prolegomena, Appendix I, and Appendix II are each preserved in handwritten drafts on lined paper and typed drafts. The Prolegomena exists in one handwritten and two typed drafts, which in the Bodleian collection are filed as MS. Stein 391 pp. 1–12 (handwritten), MS. Stein 391 pp. 7–18^v, dated September 14th 1941 and revised 29/8/1941 [sic]^{vi} (typed draft A), and MS. Stein 391 pp. 19–34, also dated

iii Stein's own description of manuscript M in Appendix II *ad* I., p. xii reads: "On the same visit to Kaśmīr Professor E. Hultzsch acquired the old, incomplete but important, manuscript M which has proved to represent a text independent of the archetype A. It enabled him subsequently to publish many various readings from this manuscript which together with a series of convincing emendations are of distinct value for the improvement of the text of the Chronicle and its interpretation; see his 'Critical Notes' in the *Indian Antiquary*, XL., pp. 97–102; XLII., pp. 301–6; *Z.D.M.G.*, LXIX., pp. 129–167, 271–282."

iv See the Prolegomena printed in this volume, p. 15.

v The numbering of these pages is a bit erratic. It starts at one and continues to twelve, then returns and begins numbering again at 7. I have kept the pagination as in the Oxford manuscripts.

vi It seems likely that Stein here mistakenly wrote 8 for 9. In that case, typed draft A would be later than typed draft B. The differences between the readings of the two typed drafts are minimal, and I have marked the few portions which are missing from typed draft A.

September 14th 1941 but revised on the 25/9/1941 (typed draft B). In this publication, I have taken draft B as the basis for the text reproduced. Even though B may actually be earlier, it contains two sentences not present in the other draft, and from a pragmatic point of view it seemed better to present the fuller text. The two typewritten drafts of the Prolegomena have many minor variations in punctuation and wording, however after the corrections written in Stein's hand are applied, the two drafts agree with each other to a high degree. Where there is an interesting variant, I have included a footnote.

The Stein Collection contains one typed draft of Appendix I (MS. Stein 391 pp. 35–53) and one handwritten and one typed draft of Appendix II (MS. Stein 391 pp. 54–79^{vii} and 391 pp. 80–132, respectively). I have used the typed drafts – each of which have “Revised for press” written in pencil in Stein's hand – as the basis of my edition. While I have tried to leave Stein's text untouched as far as I was able. In editing these manuscripts of the Prolegomena and the Appendices, I have silently corrected obvious spelling and grammatical errors and standardized punctuation usage and citational practice and have in a few places added or changed prepositions and articles in accordance with standard English usage. I have made no changes based on stylistic grounds. I have applied Stein's handwritten corrections and additions and have only supplied footnotes where these changes seemed problematic. One should also note that in many places Stein left the citations unfilled, presenting only the name of an author and a year, for instance, without giving the exact page number. In such cases I have done my best to fill in the gaps, but often I could not find the exact parallel in the cited work. Where I was unable to trace a work or reference, I have retained Stein's ellipses and supplied a footnote. I have also chosen to follow the typographical style of Stein's edition of the *Rājatarāṅgiṇī* as closely as possible, using small capital letters for the names of authors, etc. However, one should note that Stein is often idiosyncratic in his application of italics and other typographical markers. I have chosen to follow Stein's own choices as far as possible. In the end, I hope these small choices provide some sort of continuity with the text of the *Rājatarāṅgiṇī* which he had completed almost a half-century earlier.

Throughout these works I have supplied a very few notes about the content of Stein's Appendices and Prolegomena as well as notes pointing out interesting variants or lacunae in the manuscripts, however, I have tried to keep my footnotes to a minimum. I have marked my additional notes with Roman numerals in order to avoid confusion with Stein's own notes in the Prolegomena for which he uses Arabic numerals.

vii For the handwritten draft the pagination is again erratic, numbering only every other page.

A large part of this publication is concerned with the photographs Stein had taken on his tour of Kashmir in the autumn of 1940. I located handwritten lists of photographs (MS. Stein 391 pp. 133–137, dated April 1942, and MS. Stein 391 pp. 139–141, undated) included in the same group of Bodleian manuscripts that provide the basis for the texts in this volume. The dated list contained geographical place names, photograph numbers, and page numbers traceable to the two volumes of the *Rājatarāṅgiṇī* translation, and as such I have used the dated list as the basis for the photographs here reproduced. The photograph numbers and names matched photographs kept in the Bodleian and in the archives of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences, all of the “R” (probably for *Rājatarāṅgiṇī*) series. It seems that after Stein’s death in 1943, the photographs were divided between the United Kingdom and Hungary and were not seen as part of one coherent collection.

This book reproduces those photographs with the titles mentioned in the dated list. I was able to trace the vast majority of the photographs mentioned, however it must be noted that Stein’s photograph list contained in the Western Manuscripts collection of the Bodleian is incomplete. Stein merely listed some place names as “taken” or left the space next to a page number blank. Perhaps another more complete list of the photographs exists, but I have been unable to locate it in either Budapest or Oxford.^{viii} I have listed the untraced and unspecified photographs or sites in an appendix. I have further decided to include only those photographs Stein positively identified with references in order to give an approximation of his vision of an *illustrated Rājatarāṅgiṇī*. These photographs provide an invaluable visual contextualization of Kalhaṇa’s poem as well as allowing a glimpse of the archaeological sites of Kashmir taken more than half a century ago. I have included both the captions on the photographs (in the case of those from Oxford) or catalogue list (in the case of those from Budapest) and the captions of the list, since those on the photographs tend to use the Kashmiri names, while those on the list the Sanskrit. I have provided an index to the verses, pages, and places that are illustrated by Stein’s photographs and have attempted to give both the Kashmiri and Sanskrit names.

This volume concludes with reprints of the four articles of Eugene Hultzsch in the *Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft* and the *Indian Antiquary* that so strongly influenced Stein’s thinking on the Sanskrit text of the *Rājatarāṅgiṇī*. With Hultzsch’s discovery of manuscript M, it became clear that there was another, sometimes very different, recension of Kalhaṇa’s text. Stein has in many places accepted the emendations of Hultzsch based on M, in several reported M’s variants, and in a number has ignored the variants reported by Hultzsch.^{ix} The addition of 161 verses

viii All of these photographs come from the “R” (presumably for *Rājatarāṅgiṇī*) series. In the collections kept in Oxford and Budapest, this series contains many more than those few listed in the Oxford list.

ix For Stein’s use of Hultzsch, see the Prolegomena, esp. p. 20.

in M reported by Stein is given in its entirety in Hultzsch's "Kritische Bemerkungen zur Rājatarāṅgiṇī."^x In light of the great benefit Hultzsch's articles have to the understanding of Stein's notes, as well as the textual history of the *Rājatarāṅgiṇī* itself, it seemed necessary to include these articles which have been unfortunately largely forgotten by those studying Kalhaṇa's text within this volume for purposes of cross reference and textual comparison. These papers are presented in facsimile as originally printed.

There are many people to whom I would like to express my gratitude. First and foremost I would like to thank Prof. Dr. Walter Slaje of the Universität Halle-Wittenberg for his continuous enthusiasm and gracious support for this project. Without his unflagging interest and constant encouragement, this book would not have been possible. I would also like to express my deepest gratitude to Dr. Katrin Einicke who helped finalize this project with her unparalleled editorial eye. Dipl.-Ind. Andreas Pohlus also helped greatly with the publication process. I would like to thank Profs. Alexis Sanderson and Christopher Minkowski who helped me gain access to the Stein collection kept in the Bodleian Library in Oxford. The British Academy kindly granted permission to edit the Stein manuscripts and reprint the photographs contained in the Bodleian's collections. Dr. Ágnes Kelecsényi provided invaluable assistance at the Hungarian Academy of Sciences, and was always ready to lend a helping hand in procuring the photographs reproduced. I would also like to thank Prof. Csaba Deszõ and Róbert Válóczy for their hospitality during my stay in Budapest. Last but not least, I would like to thank the Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst for providing me with the opportunity to study at the Universität Halle-Wittenberg where most of this research took place.

Luther Obrock
Halle an der Saale, 2012

x See ZDMG 69 (1915), reprinted in this volume, p. 195. It is important to note that the so-called critical edition of Kalhaṇa by Vishva Bandhu (Hoshiarpur 1963) is neither aware of the existence of manuscript "M" nor of "Kalhaṇa's revised text". There is not the slightest hint to Hultzsch's discovery and edition of these 161 additional *ślokas* traceable in the Hoshiarpur edition, which renders the reprint of Hultzsch's paper in the present book all the more important.